

Questions

About you

(Note: Information entered in this “About You” section may be published with your response (unless it is “not for publication”), except where indicated in **bold**.)

1. Are you responding as:

- an individual – in which case go to Q2A
- on behalf of an organisation? – in which case go to Q2B

2A. Which of the following best describes you? (If you are a professional or academic, but not in a subject relevant to the consultation, please choose “Member of the public”.)

- Politician (MSP/MP/Peer/MEP/Councillor)
- Professional with experience in a relevant subject
- Academic with expertise in a relevant subject
- Member of the public

Optional: You may wish to explain briefly what expertise or experience you have that is relevant to the subject-matter of the consultation:

I am very familiar with the research in prostitution in the UK and in Westernised countries and have had input into several consultations on prostitution in Scotland and England

2B. Please select the category which best describes your organisation:

- Public sector body (Scottish/UK Government or agency, local authority, NDPB)
- Commercial organisation (company, business)
- Representative organisation (trade union, professional association)
- Third sector (charitable, campaigning, social enterprise, voluntary, non-profit)
- Other (e.g., clubs, local groups, groups of individuals, etc.)

Optional: You may wish to explain briefly what the organisation does, its experience and expertise in the subject-matter of the consultation, and how the view expressed in the response was arrived at (e.g., whether it is the view of particular officeholders or has been approved by the membership as a whole).

3. Please choose one of the following:

- I am content for this response to be published and attributed to me or my organisation
- I would like this response to be published anonymously
- I would like this response to be considered, but not published (“not for publication”)

If you have requested anonymity or asked for your response not to be published, please give a reason. **(Note: your reason will not be published.)**

4. Please provide your name or the name of your organisation. **(Note: The name will not be published if you have asked for the response to be anonymous or “not for publication”.)**

Please provide a way in which we can contact you if there are queries regarding your response. Email is preferred but you can also provide a postal address or phone number. **(Note: We will not publish these contact details.)**

Data protection declaration

- I confirm that I have read and understood the [Privacy Notice](#) to this consultation which explains how my personal data will be used.

If you are under 12 and making a submission, we will need to contact you to ask your parent or guardian to confirm to us that they are happy for you to send us your views.

- Please **ONLY** place an x in the brackets if you are **UNDER** 12 years of age.

YOUR VIEWS ON THE PROPOSAL

1. What is your view of introducing a new criminal offence of paying for sexual services? (This is the only mandatory question)

- Fully supportive
- Partially supportive
- Neutral (neither support nor oppose)
- Partially opposed
- Fully opposed
- Don't want to express a view

Please explain the reasons for your response.

There have been at least eleven consultations launched by UK and NI parliamentarians to promote the "End demand" (or client criminalization) There have been at least twelve consultations launched by UK and NI parliamentarians to promote the "End demand" (or client criminalization) model of prostitution reform (with the aim of abolishing prostitution)and this is the fourth such consultation on prostitution policy in Scotland. (Trish Goodman 2010 ,Rhoda Grant 2012,Equally Safe 2020 and this one).

This is despite the fact that public opinion research from large scale surveys by IPSOS Mori and other large pollsters find that the public opinion on sex work is very pragmatic. One particularly robust finding is that 59% of people believe that 'sex work is work that women should be allowed to do if they choose'. This finding is replicated in a number of large and reputable surveys even when pre-empted by push polling or leading questions related to trafficking, or asking questions about daughters engaged in sex work. A recent survey conducted in Scotland found Scots oppose SNP plans to ban the purchase of sex, with 47% saying it should be legal – compared to 32% who disagree

- Public tell SNP Government to junk plans for "Nordic Model" and instead focus on protecting sex workers and reducing stigma
- Public opposes all key elements of SNP sex work policy, and tell ministers to instead listen to sex workers and groups that represent them

see <https://nationaluglymugs.org/2024/05/30/scottish-voters-reject-snps-policy-on-sex-work>

I think it is fair to say that in these consultations the views of prostitutes –who are those who would be most affected by the proposed legislation were ignored in favour of the preformed opinions of the proposer.

If any prostitutes are listened to it is those of organised groups of "Survivors" not a term used by most who have left prostitution, but by those who have exited and allied themselves with abolitionists to oppose prostitution and now see their experiences as exploitative and

their customers as abusers. Weitzer, R 2009 Sociology of Sex Work Ann, Rev Sociol 35, 213-234 <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/e0b1/e5f82519fa9f564213e56b7d014e0ef5ece2.pdf>)

As Kinnell notes (Kinnell, H 2002 Why feminists should rethink on sex workers rights <http://www.nswp.org/sites/nswp.org/files/KINNELL-FEMINISTS.pdf>) . "While I do not doubt that some experience their involvement in sex work in the ways we have heard so frequently described, I know numerous others that experience and/or conceptualize their involvement in sex work quite differently. This is one reason why I dislike and distrust reliance on "personal testimony" instead of objective research or collective demands, since by its very nature, personal testimony privileges certain voices above others."

To get a less biased view I examined the posts of over 100 exited prostitutes on Mumsnet and found while some had awful experiences in prostitution the majority enjoyed their time, not all those who "survived" or "exited" view their experiences negatively. (for a fuller description see Annex B in this submission to the Womans and equalities select committee <http://data.parliament.uk/writtenevidence/committeeevidence.svc/evidencedocument/women-and-equalities-committee/prostitution/written/105122.html>). What the results show is that there is a range of experience and to claim that experiences of "survivors" of prostitution are always dire or traumatic (as abolitionists would have it) is simply not true. Neither is it true that all leave unscathed by their experiences. And very few (even those with bad experiences) supported the Nordic or "End demand" model In brief many prostitutes do not regard themselves as having been exploited or have had a terrible time in prostitution. A Scottish Government report (Exploring available evidence on prostitution in Scotland via practitioner-based Interviews 2016 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/exploring-available-knowledge-evidence-prostitution-scotland-via-practitioner-based-interviews/>) failed to interview a single prostitute.

Examples of prostitutes talking about their work and being ignored: "I experience psychological violence every time I read about how I am supposedly "exploited" in my work. Women with whom I have had this conversation clearly are focused on the media's stereotype of this work, and have no idea that MOST of this work is carried out indoors under similar situations as what I do. I get very frustrated that so-called "feminists" work incessantly to silence those of us who do speak out about the general enjoyment (or even mere economic independence) we experience from our work." (F475-Jade) From (Jenkins S 2009 Beyond gender: an examination of exploitation in sex work p181) <https://www.scribd.com/document/231296590/Beyond-Gender-Jenkins-PhD-2009>

There have been a large number of threads on Mumsnet over the

years to which nearly 200 prostitutes have contributed
Brazenhussy0 11-Oct-16 16:37:55
https://www.mumsnet.com/Talk/am_i_being_unreasonable/2753511-AIBU-to-not-want-brothels-legalised?pg=1&messages=100
I'm a prostitute, and honest to God I'm absolutely sick of being told that I'm being abused in my work or that I must have some kind of childhood trauma in my background. It's just so insulting to see these kinds of broad-brush assumptions over and over and over again
KIMCAR
http://www.mumsnet.com/Talk/womens_rights/2323538-The-greens-and-prostitutes?messages=100&pg=1
Fri 06-Mar-15 09:44:47 Anyway, I will sum up thusly: when I hear "facts" bandied about prostitution, I am often shocked and think "What the f...k are they talking about? That's not my experience and I don't know anybody who has that experience." When I read "90% of prostitutes are trafficked, pimped, and abused" it literally sounds as bizarre as something like, "90% of the women on Mumsnet are alcoholics."

FairyLightsAreMyCrack
https://www.mumsnet.com/Talk/mumsnet_classics/3785339-I-m-Middle-Class-ask-me-anything?pg=2&messages=100

Sat 04-Jan-20 10:25:35I am a member of an often marginalised community and middle class do-gooding women often feel they can tell me how to live my life, despite not knowing anything about the issues they are preaching about. Most of the time they do more harm than good. How can I get them to stop? Should I distract them with hummus? Is there a special accent I have to speak in to get them to listen?

Not only don't you listen to the voices of prostitutes you do not cite or appear familiar with any of the large academic literature documenting the nature of prostitution, prostitutes and their clients. Instead you unquestioningly adopt a narrow radical feminist view of prostitution being "violence against women" and "sexual exploitation" despite reams of evidence to the contrary.

2. **What is your view of repealing section 46 of the Civic Government (Scotland) Act 1982: the offence of soliciting for the purposes of prostitution in a public place?**

- Fully supportive
- Partially supportive
- Neutral (neither support nor oppose)
- Partially opposed
- Fully opposed
- Unsure

Please explain the reasons for your response.

3. **What is your view of repealing previous convictions under section 46 of the Civic Government (Scotland) Act 1982: the offence of soliciting for the purposes of prostitution in a public place?**

- Fully supportive
- Partially supportive
- Neutral (neither support nor oppose)
- Partially opposed
- Fully opposed
- Unsure

Please explain the reasons for your response.

A criminal conviction can count against future employment and makes it difficult for someone to turn their life around

4. **What is your view of giving people in prostitution the legal right to support?**

- Fully supportive
- Partially supportive
- Neutral (neither support nor oppose)
- Partially opposed
- Fully opposed
- Unsure

Please explain the reasons for your response.

5. **What is your view of including provisions for exiting services in the bill?**

- Fully supportive
- Partially supportive
- Neutral (neither support nor oppose)
- Partially opposed
- Fully opposed
- Unsure

Please explain the reasons for your response.

The majority who leave prostitution do so without

support-its a minority especially street prostitutes who may have addiction problems that need support

6. **How should the proposed offence be enforced. Are there any particular techniques which you think should be used or obstacles which might need to be overcome?**

I dont think they should be enforced-the policing of what is a consensual act by means of wiretaps etc are a gross breach of civil liberties

7. **Do you believe that there are any new policing powers that would be necessary or beneficial for enforcing this offence?**

no

8. **Please indicate which of the following forms of support and/or services you think should be provided for people in prostitution and exiting prostitution (place an x into the brackets of as many options as you agree with):**

- Exiting support workers
- Drop in services
- Outreach visits to brothels, saunas and other similar premises
- Specialist medical consultations
- Access to drug and alcohol services
- Access to counselling and psychological treatment services
- Specialist housing schemes for women in crisis
- Support to access education, training or work
- Financial advice, debt support etc
- Other (please give details)

Please explain the reasons for your response and provide examples of best practice.

For the minority who need help exiting some support might be useful

9. **Please indicate which of the following ways of raising awareness of the new offence you believe to be most effective (choose as many as you agree with):**

- Internet and social media advertising
- TV advertising
- Print media advertising

- Billboards in public places and transport
- Leaflets to households
- Materials to support and exiting services for people involved in prostitution
- Materials targeted at areas where prostitution is known to occur
- Materials to health and mental health services
- Materials to further education sector
- Inclusion in secondary education (Relationship, Sexual Health, Parenting classes)
- Other (please give details)

Please explain the reasons for your response.

While there are some -especially street workers who may need help for drug addiction etc for the majority who work indoors are better educated could find work except they will be penalized by the benefit system

10. Do you think legislation is required, or are there are other ways in which the Bill's aims could be achieved more effectively?

Please explain the reasons for your response.

Decriminalisation as recommended by the majority of the replies to the Equally safe consultation

Resource implications

11. Taking into account all those likely to be affected (including public sector bodies, businesses and individuals etc), is the proposed Bill likely to lead to:

- a significant increase in costs
- some increase in costs
- no overall change in costs
- some reduction in costs
- a significant reduction in costs
- do not wish to express a view

Please indicate where you would expect the impact identified to fall (including public sector bodies, businesses and individuals etc). You may also wish to suggest ways in which the aims of the Bill could be delivered more cost-effectively.

Significant costs in policing-gross breaches of civil liberties

Equalities

12: Any new law can have an impact on different individuals and groups in society, for example as a result of their age, disability, gender re-assignment, marriage and civil partnership status, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion or belief, sex or sexual orientation. What impact could this proposal have on particular people if it became law?

Please explain the reasons for your answer and if there are any ways you think the proposal could avoid negative impacts on particular people.

To make sex purchase illegal while making its provision legal is like allowing dentists but not dentistry. Its bonkers

Sustainability

13. Any new law can impact on work to protect and enhance the environment, achieve a sustainable economy, and create a strong, healthy, and just society for future generations. Do you think the proposal could impact in any of these areas?